

INTERPRETING PRECEDENTS

A COMPARATIVE STUDY

Edited by

D. NEIL MacCORMICK

*Regius Professor of Public Law and the Law of Nature and Nations
University of Edinburgh*

and

ROBERT S. SUMMERS

*McRoberts Research Professor of Law Cornell University; Arthur L.
Goodhart Visiting Professor of Legal Science, University of Cambridge,
1991–92*

First published 1997 by Ashgate Publishing

Published 2016 by Routledge

2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxfordshire OX14 4RN

711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017, USA

First issued in paperback 2016

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

Copyright © D. Neil MacCormick and Robert S. Summers 1997

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Notice:

Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Interpreting precedents : a comparative study. – (Applied legal philosophy)

1. Law – Interpretation and construction

I. MacCormick, Neil II. Summers, Robert S. (Robert Samuel),
1933–

340.1'1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Interpreting precedents : a comparative study / edited by D. Neil
MacCormick and Robert S. Summers.

p. cm. – (Applied legal philosophy)

1. Stare decisis. 2. Law–Interpretation and construction.

I. MacCormick, Neil. II. Summers, Robert S. III. Series.

K574.I58 1997

340–dc21

96–39520
CIP

ISBN 13: 978-1-138-27024-4 (pbk)

ISBN 13: 978-1-85521-686-0 (hbk)

Typeset by Manton Typesetters

Contents

<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Series Preface</i>	xi
1 Introduction	1
D. Neil MacCormick, <i>Edinburgh</i> and Robert S. Summers, <i>Ithaca</i>	
2 Precedent in the Federal Republic of Germany	17
Robert Alexy, <i>Kiel</i> and Ralf Dreier, <i>Göttingen</i>	
3 Precedent in Finland	65
Aulis Aarnio, <i>Tampere</i>	
4 Precedent in France	103
Michel Troper, <i>Paris</i> and Christophe Grzegorzczak, <i>Paris</i>	
5 Precedent in Italy	141
Michele Taruffo, <i>Pavia</i> and Massimo La Torre, <i>Florence</i>	
6 Precedent in Norway	189
Svein Eng, <i>Oslo</i>	
7 Precedent in Poland	219
Lech Morawski, <i>Toruń</i> and Marek Zirk-Sadowski, <i>Łódź</i>	
8 Precedent in Spain	259
Alfonso Ruiz Miguel, <i>Madrid</i> and Francisco J. Laporta, <i>Madrid</i>	
9 Precedent in Sweden	293
Gunnar Bergholtz, <i>Lund</i> and Aleksander Peczenik, <i>Lund</i>	
10 Precedent in the United Kingdom	315
Zenon Bankowski, <i>Edinburgh</i> , D. Neil MacCormick, <i>Edinburgh</i> and Geoffrey Marshall, <i>Oxford</i>	
11 Precedent in the United States (New York State)	355
Robert S. Summers, <i>Ithaca</i>	
12 Precedent in European Community Law	407
John J. Barceló, <i>Ithaca</i>	
13 Institutional Factors Influencing Precedents	437
Michele Taruffo, <i>Pavia</i>	
14 The Binding Force of Precedent	461
Aleksander Peczenik, <i>Lund</i>	

15	Rationales for Precedent	481
	Zenon Bankowski, <i>Edinburgh</i> , D. Neil MacCormick, <i>Edinburgh</i> , Lech Morawski, <i>Torun</i> and Alfonso Ruiz Miguel, <i>Madrid</i>	
16	What is Binding in a Precedent	503
	Geoffrey Marshall, <i>Oxford</i>	
17	Departures from Precedent	519
	Robert S. Summers, <i>Ithaca</i> and Svein Eng, <i>Oslo</i>	
18	Further General Reflections and Conclusions	531
	D. Neil MacCormick, <i>Edinburgh</i> and Robert S. Summers, <i>Ithaca</i>	
	<i>Appendix: Final Version of the Common Questions, Comparative Legal Precedent Study, September 1994</i>	551
	<i>About the Authors</i>	563
	<i>Index</i>	567